



THE UNIVERSITY OF  

---

MELBOURNE

MELBOURNE UNIVERSITY  
LAW REVIEW

VOLUME 41  
2017-18  
CONTENTS

The Melbourne University Law Review Association Inc  
gratefully acknowledges the combined support of

# Allens > < Linklaters



KING & WOOD  
MALLESONS



THE UNIVERSITY OF  

---

MELBOURNE

MELBOURNE UNIVERSITY  
LAW REVIEW

VOLUME 41  
2017–18  
CONTENTS

Melbourne University Law Review Association Inc  
2017–18

This volume may be cited as  
(2017–18) 41 *Melbourne University Law Review*

© Melbourne University Law Review Association Inc 2018  
Reg No A0017345F · ABN 21 447 204 764  
All rights by all media reserved

ISSN 0025-8938

## PUBLICATION DATES

The *Melbourne University Law Review* ('*Review*') publishes three issues per volume. Deadlines for submissions are 31 December, 30 April and 31 August.

## INFORMATION FOR CONTRIBUTORS

All articles appearing in the *Review* are refereed by at least two anonymous referees. Prospective contributors are requested to submit manuscripts in electronic form by email attachment in Microsoft Word or Rich Text Format. An abstract of approximately 120 words should be included.

Submissions will be considered only if they are accompanied by a completed Publication Policy available from the *Review* website. In accordance with the Publication Policy, the *Review* does not accept articles that have already been published or are under consideration by other publications.

The advisory word limit for submissions is 8,000 to 12,000 words. Lengthy passages of discursive text in footnotes will be counted towards this advisory limit.

Citation in the *Review* is governed by the *Australian Guide to Legal Citation* ('*AGLC*'). It is preferred if submissions are formatted in accordance with the *AGLC*. Bibliographies should not be included. Citations should be in the form of footnotes. The *AGLC* is written and published by the Melbourne University Law Review Association Inc in collaboration with the Melbourne Journal of International Law Inc. It is available for purchase at a cost of A\$20.00 (including GST), plus postage and handling. The *AGLC* can also be viewed free of charge on the *Review* website. Please contact the *Review* for further details.

All correspondence should be addressed to:

The Editors	Telephone	+61 3 8344 6593
<i>Melbourne University Law Review</i>	Facsimile	+61 3 9347 8087
Melbourne Law School	Email	law-mulr@unimelb.edu.au
The University of Melbourne	Website	<a href="http://www.law.unimelb.edu.au/mulr">http://www.law.unimelb.edu.au/mulr</a>
Victoria 3010		
Australia		

## SUBSCRIPTIONS

Subscription requests and queries are managed by Thomson Reuters (Professional) Australia. Please contact:

Thomson Reuters Customer Service	Telephone	+61 2 8587 7980
PO Box 3502	Facsimile	+61 2 8587 7981
Rozelle	Email	lta.service@thomsonreuters.com
New South Wales 2039		
Australia		

## BACK ISSUES AND SINGLE ISSUES

Back and single issues are available from the *Review*. Queries regarding back and single issues should be addressed to:

The Publications Manager	Telephone	+61 3 8344 6593
<i>Melbourne University Law Review</i>	Facsimile	+61 3 9347 8087
Melbourne Law School	Email	law-mulr@unimelb.edu.au
The University of Melbourne	Website	<a href="http://www.law.unimelb.edu.au/mulr">http://www.law.unimelb.edu.au/mulr</a>
Victoria 3010		
Australia		



# MELBOURNE UNIVERSITY LAW REVIEW

Volume 41

2017–18

## EDITORIAL BOARD

### EDITORS

Jordonne Colley

Chenez Dyer Bray

Marcus Roberts

CASE NOTE  
EDITORS  
Adrian Faelli  
Matthew Harper  
Rachel Walters

SECRETARIES  
Anna Liu  
Rucha Sohani  
Samuel Crock  
Nicholas Felstead

CRITIQUE AND  
COMMENT EDITOR  
Joanna Bloore

ASSISTANT  
SECRETARIES  
BUSINESS  
MANAGER  
Sarah Huang

SUBMISSIONS COORDINATORS  
Luisa Borg  
Kye-Ren Cheong  
Jacinta Cox  
Nicholas Felstead

ASSISTANT  
BUSINESS  
MANAGER  
Srikanan Nadador  
PUBLICATIONS  
MANAGER  
Georgina Long  
MARKETING AND  
DISTRIBUTION  
MANAGER  
Alexandra Theile

### ASSISTANT EDITORS

Joanna Bloore  
Luisa Borg  
Elizabeth Brumby  
Nathan Brumley  
Jack Cairns  
Peter Catterson  
Kye-Ren Cheong  
Luke Chircop  
Danielle El-Hajj

ADMINISTRATIVE  
ASSISTANTS  
Victoria Christie  
Lachlan Ince  
Amanda Lekamge  
Emily Mackay  
Jack Stone  
Lily Xiao

GENERAL MEMBERS  
Georgia Bourke  
Rosie Cham  
Georgie Clough  
Jacinta Cox  
Samuel Crock  
Joshua Crowther  
Kevin Cui  
Stuart Dixon  
Harvey Duckett  
Nicholas Felstead  
Sean Gilmartin  
Lachlan Gleeson  
James Gould  
Kirsty Ha  
Timothy Higgins  
Harry Hill-Smith  
Ken Kiat

COMMUNITY  
PROGRAM  
COORDINATORS  
Adrian Faelli  
Anushka Seth  
ALUMNI  
ASSOCIATION  
COORDINATORS  
Molly Deighton  
Calypso Strauss  
Alexander Di Stefano  
Stephen Lee  
Anna Liu  
Jack North  
Arj Wijegunaratne

AGLC ONLINE  
DEVELOPERS  
COMMUNICATIONS  
COORDINATORS  
Jay Kim  
Dinu Kumarasinghe  
PRODUCTION  
EDITOR  
Lincoln Smith

ASSISTANT  
PRODUCTION  
EDITOR  
Sarah Waring  
IT MANAGER  
Stephen Lee

TRAINING  
MANAGERS  
Joanna Bloore  
Luke Chircop  
Danielle El-Hajj  
Matthew Harper

### FACULTY ADVISERS

Ian Malkin

Jenny Morgan

Dale Smith



## PAST EDITORS

1957	PR Jordan JD Phillips	1978	Elizabeth Murphy Garrie Moloney	1998	Chester Brown Lisa Teasdale Katie Young
1958	RC Tadgell NR McPhee	1979	Thomas Reid Hilary Charlesworth	1999	Nick Anson Paul Liondas Sarah Martin
1959	JM Batt JA Griffin	1980	John Angus Julie Turner	2000	Sarah Leighfield Andrew North Anna Thwaites
1960	NHM Forsyth AA Browne	1981	Nora Scheinkestel Mark Steele	2001	Luke Livingstone Jeremy Masters David Morgan
1961	RC Horsfall AH Goldberg	1982	Karin Chua Mark Darian-Smith	2002	Eloise Dias Joel Fetter Rowan McRae
1962	DM Byrne GF Griffith R Sackville	1983	Donald Maloney Steven Pemberton	2003	Simona Gory Anthony O'Brien Simon Raffin
1963	R Sackville JJ Tait PJ Bayne	1984	Stephen McLeish Lynne Saunder	2004	Howard Choo Liam Gilchrist Tanya Josev
1964	P Mandie PLA Gore	1985	Diana Pinti Elspeth Strong	2005	James McComish Rebecca Pereira Tamara Vu
1965	JR Bowman MM Leibler	1986	Meriel Rule Anne Woodger	2006	Veggie Cari Stephanie Chu Benjamin Kiely
1966	KM Hayne R Richter	1987	Mark Moshinsky Kim Rubenstein	2007	Katherine Cooke Rich Hewett Sze-Beng Tang
1967	GJ Harris FH Callaway	1988	Grant Anderson Anne Twomey	2008	Wilfred Ho Dakshinee Kodituwakku Sunny Leow
1968	PR Just CA Sweeney	1989	Chris Horan Jim Minifie	2009	David Heaton Luke Pallaras Anna Zhang
1969	AJ Myers JMCI Walter	1990	Debbie Barbour Peter Mellor	2010	Rudi Kruse Kathryn Tomic Christopher Tran
1970	FC O'Brien H Boon	1991	Anna Funder Kristen Walker	2011	David Foster Timothy Lau Julia Wang
1971	RJ Clemente MH Coppel	1992	Mary-Anne Hughson Carl McCamish Jason Pizer	2012	Thomas Bland Natalie Burgess Christopher Loo
1972	SD Wynn AJ Duggan	1993	Justine FitzGerald Nick Linnane Stephen Parmenter		
1973	Catherine M Sweeney DJ Cremean	1994	Peter Danchin Neil Pathak		
1974	Josephine M D'Arcy MF Macnamara	1995	Simon Chesterman Stephen Donaghue Eleanor McKinna		
1975	DJ Gifford TP Murphy	1996	Rae Kaspiew Kathy Liddell Alan Scott		
1976	Susan Kenny MCH Hoyle	1997	Catherine Button Andrew Mitchell Paula O'Brien		
1977	Jennifer Eastick John Carmel				

## PAST EDITORS

- 2013 Cindy Bors  
Sasha Ponniah  
Thomas Wood
- 2014 Katherine France  
Joshua Keyes Liley  
Shawn Rajanayagam
- 2015 George Priestley  
Emily Rothfield  
Cal Samson
- 2016 Stephen Polesel  
Phoebe St John  
Thomas Wu

# CONTENTS

Volume 41

2017–18

## ARTICLES

- Negligence Claims by Subsequent Building Owners:  
Did the Life of *Bryan* End Too Soon?  
*Matthew Bell and Wayne Jocic* 1
- Parliament, the Judiciary and Fundamental Rights:  
The Strength of the Principle of Legality  
*Francis Cardell-Oliver* 30
- Anti-Suit Injunctions in Australia  
*Michael Douglas* 66
- Icarus and the *Evidence Act*: Section 137, Probative Value and  
Taking Forensic Science Evidence ‘at its Highest’  
*Gary Edmond* 106
- Government Contracts and Public Law  
*The Hon KM Hayne AC* 155
- Cosmopolitan Originalism: Revisiting the Role of  
International Law in Constitutional Interpretation  
*Noam Kolt* 182
- Australia’s Accession to the *Hague Convention on  
Choice of Court Agreements*  
*Brooke Adele Marshall and Mary Keyes* 246
- Regulating Cyber-Racism  
*Gail Mason and Natalie Czapski* 284
- Marginalising Health Information: Implications of the  
*Trans-Pacific Partnership Agreement* for Alcohol Labelling  
*Paula O’Brien, Deborah Gleeson,  
Robin Room and Claire Wilkinson* 341

Charities Are the New Constitutional Law Frontier	<i>Nicholas Aroney and Matthew Turnour</i>	446
The Constitutional Prohibition on Imposing Religious Observances	<i>Luke Beck</i>	493
Open Secrets: Balancing Operational Secrecy and Transparency in the Collection and Use of Data by National Security and Law Enforcement Agencies	<i>Lyría Bennett Moses and Louis de Koker</i>	530
Liability for Assisting Torts	<i>Henry Cooper</i>	571
The 'Reasonable Tort Victim': Contributory Negligence, Standard of Care and the 'Equivalence Theory'	<i>Joachim Dietrich and Iain Field</i>	602
Appeals from Discretions, Satisfactions and Value Judgments: Reviewing the <i>House</i> Rules	<i>Chris Edmonds</i>	647
The Unstable Province of Jury Fact-Finding: Evidence Exclusion, Probative Value and Judicial Restraint after <i>IMM v The Queen</i>	<i>David Hamer</i>	689
Simplifying Legal Decisions: Factor Overload in Civil Procedure Rules	<i>Inbar Levy</i>	727
The Limits of Political Libel: Conscriptio and the <i>Ryan v The Argus</i> Libel Trial	<i>Mark Lunney</i>	758

Shaping the 'Next Generation' of Climate Change Litigation in Australia	<i>Jacqueline Peel, Hari Osofsky and Anita Foerster</i>	793
The Utility of Citizenship Stripping Laws in the UK, Canada and Australia	<i>Sangeetha Pillai and George Williams</i>	845
Judicial Review and Public Law: Challenging the Preconceptions of a Troubled Taxonomy	<i>Stephen Thomson</i>	890
The Evolution of Bias: Spectrums, Species and the Weary Lay Observer	<i>Simon Young</i>	928
Rights in Geospatial Information: A Shifting Legal Terrain	<i>Isabella Alexander and Marlena Jankowska</i>	957
Shelter from the Storm: Phoenix Activity and the Safe Harbour	<i>Helen Anderson</i>	999
Remedies for Migrant Worker Exploitation in Australia: Lessons from the 7-Eleven Wage Repayment Program	<i>Laurie Berg and Bassina Farbenblum</i>	1035
A Compromised Balance? A Comparative Examination of Exceptions to Age Discrimination Law in Australia and the UK	<i>Alysia Blackham</i>	1085
The Future of Joint Trials of Sex Offences after <i>Hughes</i> : Resolving Judicial Fears and Jurisdictional Tensions with Evidence-Based Decision-Making	<i>Annie Cossins</i>	1121

The Concept of Coherence in Australian Private Law

*Andrew Fell* 1160

Equal Consideration and Informed Imagining:  
Recognising and Responding to the Lived Experiences of  
Abused Women Who Kill

*Anthony Hopkins, Anna Carline and Patricia Easteal* 1201

Shotgun Referendums: Popular Deliberation and  
Constitutional Settlement in Conflict Societies

*Ron Levy* 1237

The Introduction of Limited Liability into the  
English and Australian Colonial Companies Acts:  
Inevitable Progression or Chaotic History?

*Phillip Lipton* 1278

The Doctrine of Extended Joint Criminal Enterprise:  
A 'Wrong Turn' in Australian Common Law

*Timothy Smartt* 1324

## CASE NOTES

*Ceramic Fuel Cells Ltd (in liq) v McGraw-Hill Financial Inc*  
Accessing Third Party Documents in a Foreign Jurisdiction  
by Subpoena: The *Ceramic Fuel Cells Ltd (in liq) v*  
*McGraw-Hill Financial Inc* Class Action

*Michael Legg and Joshua Kang* 392

*DPP (Vic) v O'Neill*  
Sentencing Offenders with Personality Disorders:  
A Critical Analysis of *DPP (Vic) v O'Neill*

*Jamie Walvisch and Andrew Carroll* 417

*ACB v Thomson Medical Pte Ltd*

Recovery of Upkeep Costs, Claims for Loss of Autonomy  
and Loss of Genetic Affinity:  
Fertile Ground for Development?

*Jordan English and Mohammad Hafeez-Baig* 1360

## **CRITIQUE AND COMMENT**

Executive and Legislative Power in the Implementation of  
Intergovernmental Agreements

*The Hon Robert French AC* 1383

The Changing Position and Duties of Company Directors

*The Hon Justice Geoffrey Nettle* 1402

## ARTICLES BY AUTHOR

Alexander, Isabella and Marlena Jankowska	
<i>Rights in Geospatial Information: A Shifting Legal Terrain</i>	957
Anderson, Helen	
<i>Shelter from the Storm: Phoenix Activity and the Safe Harbour</i>	999
Aroney, Nicholas and Matthew Turnour	
<i>Charities Are the New Constitutional Law Frontier</i>	446
Beck, Luke	
<i>The Constitutional Prohibition on Imposing Religious Observances</i>	493
Bell, Matthew and Wayne Jocic	
<i>Negligence Claims by Subsequent Building Owners: Did the Life of Bryan End Too Soon?</i>	1
Bennett Moses, Lyria and Louis de Koker	
<i>Open Secrets: Balancing Operational Secrecy and Transparency in the Collection and Use of Data by National Security and Law Enforcement Agencies</i>	530
Berg, Laurie and Bassina Farbenblum	
<i>Remedies for Migrant Worker Exploitation in Australia: Lessons from the 7-Eleven Wage Repayment Program</i>	1035
Blackham, Alysia	
<i>A Compromised Balance? A Comparative Examination of Exceptions to Age Discrimination Law in Australia and the UK</i>	1085
Cardell-Oliver, Francis	
<i>Parliament, the Judiciary and Fundamental Rights: The Strength of the Principle of Legality</i>	30
Cooper, Henry	
<i>Liability for Assisting Torts</i>	571

Cossins, Annie	<i>The Future of Joint Trials of Sex Offences after Hughes: Resolving Judicial Fears and Jurisdictional Tensions with Evidence-Based Decision-Making</i>	1121
Dietrich, Joachim and Iain Field	<i>The 'Reasonable Tort Victim': Contributory Negligence, Standard of Care and the 'Equivalence Theory'</i>	602
Douglas, Michael	<i>Anti-Suit Injunctions in Australia</i>	66
Edmond, Gary	<i>Icarus and the Evidence Act: Section 137, Probative Value and Taking Forensic Science Evidence 'at its Highest'</i>	106
Edmonds, Chris	<i>Appeals from Discretions, Satisfactions and Value Judgments: Reviewing the House Rules</i>	647
Fell, Andrew	<i>The Concept of Coherence in Australian Private Law</i>	1160
Hamer, David	<i>The Unstable Province of Jury Fact-Finding: Evidence Exclusion, Probative Value and Judicial Restraint after IMM v The Queen</i>	689
Hayne, The Hon KM AC	<i>Government Contracts and Public Law</i>	155
Hopkins, Anthony, Anna Carline and Patricia Eastal	<i>Equal Consideration and Informed Imagining: Recognising and Responding to the Lived Experiences of Abused Women Who Kill</i>	1201
Kolt, Noam	<i>Cosmopolitan Originalism: Revisiting the Role of International Law in Constitutional Interpretation</i>	182

Levy, Inbar		
	<i>Simplifying Legal Decisions: Factor Overload in Civil Procedure Rules</i>	727
Levy, Ron		
	<i>Shotgun Referendums: Popular Deliberation and Constitutional Settlement in Conflict Societies</i>	1237
Lipton, Phillip		
	<i>The Introduction of Limited Liability into the English and Australian Colonial Companies Acts: Inevitable Progression or Chaotic History?</i>	1278
Lunney, Mark		
	<i>The Limits of Political Libel: Conscriptio and the Ryan v The Argus Libel Trial</i>	758
Marshall, Brooke Adele and Mary Keyes		
	<i>Australia's Accession to the Hague Convention on Choice of Court Agreements</i>	246
Mason, Gail and Natalie Czapski		
	<i>Regulating Cyber-Racism</i>	284
O'Brien, Paula, Deborah Gleeson, Robin Room and Claire Wilkinson		
	<i>Marginalising Health Information: Implications of the Trans-Pacific Partnership Agreement for Alcohol Labelling</i>	341
Peel, Jacqueline, Hari Osofsky and Anita Foerster		
	<i>Shaping the 'Next Generation' of Climate Change Litigation in Australia</i>	793
Pillai, Sangeetha and George Williams		
	<i>The Utility of Citizenship Stripping Laws in the UK, Canada and Australia</i>	845
Smartt, Timothy		
	<i>The Doctrine of Extended Joint Criminal Enterprise: A 'Wrong Turn' in Australian Common Law</i>	1324

Thomson, Stephen  
*Judicial Review and Public Law: Challenging the  
Preconceptions of a Troubled Taxonomy* 890

Young, Simon  
*The Evolution of Bias: Spectrums, Species and the  
Weary Lay Observer* 928

## CASE NOTES BY AUTHOR

English, Jordan and Mohammad Hafeez-Baig  
ACB v Thomson Medical Pte Ltd 1360  
*Recovery of Upkeep Costs, Claims for Loss of Autonomy and  
Loss of Genetic Affinity: Fertile Ground for Development?*

Legg, Michael and Joshua Kang  
Ceramic Fuel Cells Ltd (in liq) v McGraw-Hill Financial Inc 392  
*Accessing Third Party Documents in a Foreign Jurisdiction  
by Subpoena: The Ceramic Fuel Cells Ltd (in liq) v  
McGraw-Hill Financial Inc Class Action*

Walvisch, Jamie and Andrew Carroll  
DPP (Vic) v O'Neill 417  
*Sentencing Offenders with Personality Disorders:  
A Critical Analysis of DPP (Vic) v O'Neill*

## CRITIQUE AND COMMENT BY AUTHOR

French, The Hon Robert AC  
*Executive and Legislative Power in the Implementation of  
Intergovernmental Agreements* 1383

Nettle, The Hon Justice Geoffrey  
*The Changing Position and Duties of Company Directors* 1402