



THE UNIVERSITY OF  

---

MELBOURNE

MELBOURNE UNIVERSITY  
LAW REVIEW

VOLUME 43  
2019–20  
CONTENTS

The Melbourne University Law Review Association Inc  
gratefully acknowledges the combined support of

## Allens > < Linklaters



KING & WOOD  
MALLESONS



THE UNIVERSITY OF  

---

MELBOURNE

MELBOURNE UNIVERSITY  
LAW REVIEW

VOLUME 43  
2019–20  
CONTENTS

Melbourne University Law Review Association Inc  
2019–20

This volume may be cited as  
(2019–20) 43 *Melbourne University Law Review*

© Melbourne University Law Review Association Inc 2020  
Reg No A0017345F · ABN 21 447 204 764  
All rights by all media reserved

ISSN 0025-8938

## PUBLICATION DATES

The *Melbourne University Law Review* ('*Review*') publishes three issues per volume. Deadlines for submissions are 31 December, 30 April and 31 August.

## INFORMATION FOR CONTRIBUTORS

All articles appearing in the *Review* are refereed by at least two anonymous referees. Prospective contributors are requested to submit manuscripts in electronic form by email attachment in Microsoft Word or Rich Text Format. An abstract of approximately 120 words should be included.

Submissions will be considered only if they are accompanied by a completed Publication Policy available from the *Review* website. In accordance with the Publication Policy, the *Review* does not accept articles that have already been published or are under consideration by other publications.

The advisory word limit for submissions is 8,000 to 12,000 words. Lengthy passages of discursive text in footnotes will be counted towards this advisory limit.

Citation in the *Review* is governed by the *Australian Guide to Legal Citation* ('*AGLC*'). It is preferred if submissions are formatted in accordance with the *AGLC*. Bibliographies should not be included. Citations should be in the form of footnotes. The *AGLC* is written and published by the Melbourne University Law Review Association Inc in collaboration with the Melbourne Journal of International Law Inc. It is available for purchase at a cost of A\$20.00 (including GST), plus postage and handling. The *AGLC* can also be viewed free of charge on the *Review* website. Please contact the *Review* for further details.

All correspondence should be addressed to:

The Editors	Telephone	+61 3 8344 6593
<i>Melbourne University Law Review</i>	Facsimile	+61 3 9347 8087
Melbourne Law School	Email	law-mulr@unimelb.edu.au
The University of Melbourne	Website	<a href="http://www.law.unimelb.edu.au/mulr">http://www.law.unimelb.edu.au/mulr</a>
Victoria 3010		
Australia		

## SUBSCRIPTIONS

Subscription requests and queries are managed by Thomson Reuters (Professional) Australia. Please contact:

Thomson Reuters Customer Service	Telephone	+61 2 8587 7980
PO Box 3502	Facsimile	+61 2 8587 7981
Rozelle	Email	lta.service@thomsonreuters.com
New South Wales 2039		
Australia		

## BACK ISSUES AND SINGLE ISSUES

Back and single issues are available from the *Review*. Queries regarding back and single issues should be addressed to:

The Publications Manager	Telephone	+61 3 8344 6593
<i>Melbourne University Law Review</i>	Facsimile	+61 3 9347 8087
Melbourne Law School	Email	law-mulr@unimelb.edu.au
The University of Melbourne	Website	<a href="http://www.law.unimelb.edu.au/mulr">http://www.law.unimelb.edu.au/mulr</a>
Victoria 3010		
Australia		

# MELBOURNE UNIVERSITY LAW REVIEW

Volume 43

2019–20

## EDITORIAL BOARD

### EDITORS

Georgia Bourke

Sam Crock

Stuart Dixon

### SUBMISSIONS COORDINATORS

Karan Desai    Kavin Nenh  
Alexandra Hancock    Bodhi Shribman-  
Clódagh Hussein    Dellmann  
Daniel Lopez    Monica Stanisis

SECRETARIES  
Nicholas Felstead  
Alexandra Hancock

ASSISTANT  
SECRETARIES  
Kavin Nenh  
Nana Owusu

### ASSISTANT EDITORS

Tom Allen    Sumen Kumareswaran  
Priyanka Banerjee    Samuel Lindsay  
Zoe Barker    Daniel Lopez  
Anthony Coter    Nabila Lucente  
Nicholas Felstead    Patrick O'Bryan  
Lachlan Gleeson    Bodhi Shribman-  
Clódagh Hussein    Dellmann  
Ken Kiat    Monica Stanisis  
April Whitehead

BUSINESS  
MANAGERS  
Priyanka Banerjee  
Alyssa Kim

PUBLICATIONS AND  
DISTRIBUTION  
MANAGERS  
Allison Berry  
Katya Harrop

Karly Banks  
Hannah Bullock  
Danielle Davidovits  
Margaret Gusah

ADMINISTRATIVE  
ASSISTANTS  
Talia Le Couteur Scott  
Holly McNaughton  
Brigitte Mercaldi  
Artemis Sfendourakis  
Ayman Shash

### GENERAL MEMBERS

Daniel Bennett-Spark    Brittany Llewellyn  
Allison Berry    Holly McNaughton  
Zoe Brown    Kavin Nenh  
Hannah Bullock    Amy O'Bryan  
Paula Castillo    Maxim Oppy  
Subin Cho    Cassie O'Regan  
Tyrone Connell    Nathan Scott  
Michael Dardis    Gemma Smith  
Saskia Davey    Shilpa Sringer  
Karan Desai    William Suhr  
James Gunn    Jessica Tang  
Lachlan Holmes    Yi Tung  
Darcy James    Jared Velik  
Tianyi Liu    Vanessa Wilson

COMMUNITY  
PROGRAM  
COORDINATORS  
Sumen Kumareswaran  
Cassie O'Regan

TRAINING  
MANAGERS  
Nicholas Felstead  
Daniel Lopez

PRODUCTION  
EDITOR  
Nathan Scott

ASSISTANT  
PRODUCTION  
EDITOR  
Georgia Millington

### AGLC ONLINE DEVELOPERS

Alexander Di Stefano  
Nicholas Felstead  
Nicholas Gillies  
Jack North

IT MANAGERS  
Michael Dardis  
Nicholas Gillies

### FACULTY ADVISERS

Ian Malkin

Andrew Mitchell

Jenny Morgan

Dale Smith

## PAST EDITORS

1957	PR Jordan JD Phillips	1978	Elizabeth Murphy Garrie Moloney	1998	Chester Brown Lisa Teasdale Katie Young
1958	RC Tadgell NR McPhee	1979	Thomas Reid Hilary Charlesworth	1999	Nick Anson Paul Liondas Sarah Martin
1959	JM Batt JA Griffin	1980	John Angus Julie Turner	2000	Sarah Leighfield Andrew North Anna Thwaites
1960	NHM Forsyth AA Browne	1981	Nora Scheinkestel Mark Steele	2001	Luke Livingstone Jeremy Masters David Morgan
1961	RC Horsfall AH Goldberg	1982	Karin Chua Mark Darian-Smith	2002	Eloise Dias Joel Fetter Rowan McRae
1962	DM Byrne GF Griffith R Sackville	1983	Donald Maloney Steven Pemberton	2003	Simona Gory Anthony O'Brien Simon Raffin
1963	R Sackville JJ Tait PJ Bayne	1984	Stephen McLeish Lynne Saunder	2004	Howard Choo Liam Gilchrist Tanya Josev
1964	P Mandie PLA Gore	1985	Diana Pinti Elspeth Strong	2005	James McComish Rebecca Pereira Tamara Vu
1965	JR Bowman MM Leibler	1986	Meriel Rule Anne Woodger	2006	Veggie Cari Stephanie Chu Benjamin Kiely
1966	KM Hayne R Richter	1987	Mark Moshinsky Kim Rubenstein	2007	Katherine Cooke Rich Hewett Sze-Beng Tang
1967	GJ Harris FH Callaway	1988	Grant Anderson Anne Twomey	2008	Wilfred Ho Dakshinee Kodituwakku Sunny Leow
1968	PR Just CA Sweeney	1989	Chris Horan Jim Minifie	2009	David Heaton Luke Pallaras Anna Zhang
1969	AJ Myers JMCI Walter	1990	Debbie Barbour Peter Mellor	2010	Rudi Kruse Kathryn Tomic Christopher Tran
1970	FC O'Brien H Boon	1991	Anna Funder Kristen Walker	2011	David Foster Timothy Lau Julia Wang
1971	RJ Clemente MH Coppel	1992	Mary-Anne Hughson Carl McCamish Jason Pizer	2012	Thomas Bland Natalie Burgess Christopher Loo
1972	SD Wynn AJ Duggan	1993	Justine FitzGerald Nick Linnane Stephen Parmenter		
1973	Catherine M Sweeney DJ Cremean	1994	Peter Danchin Neil Pathak		
1974	Josephine M D'Arcy MF Macnamara	1995	Simon Chesterman Stephen Donaghue Eleanor McKinna		
1975	DJ Gifford TP Murphy	1996	Rae Kaspiew Kathy Liddell Alan Scott		
1976	Susan Kenny MCH Hoyle	1997	Catherine Button Andrew Mitchell Paula O'Brien		
1977	Jennifer Eastick John Carmel				

## PAST EDITORS

- 2013 Cindy Bors  
Sasha Ponniah  
Thomas Wood
- 2014 Katherine France  
Joshua Keyes Liley  
Shawn Rajanayagam
- 2015 George Priestley  
Emily Rothfield  
Cal Samson
- 2016 Stephen Polesel  
Phoebe St John  
Thomas Wu
- 2017 Jordonne Colley  
Chenez Dyer Bray  
Marcus Roberts
- 2018 Kye-Ren Cheong  
Rajesh Gounder  
Rachel Walters

# CONTENTS

Volume 43

2019–20

## ARTICLES

Determining Secondary Liability:  
In Search of Legislative Coherence

*Helen Anderson* 1

Preserving the Constitutional Function of Courts and  
Increasing Confidence in the Tax System:  
Time to Reconsider *Futuris*

*John Azzi* 44

Rethinking the Law on Shareholder-Initiated Resolutions at  
Company General Meetings

*Stephen Bottomley* 93

The Shortfall Conundrum: A New Framework for Allocating  
Losses in a Mixed Fund in Australia

*Christian Chamorro-Courtland* 133

Treaty-Making in the Australian Federation

*Harry Hobbs and George Williams* 178

No Decorous Veil: The Continuing Reliance on an Enlarged  
Terra Nullius Notion in *Mabo [No 2]*

*Daniel Lavery* 233

Is There a Common Law ‘Right’ to Freedom of Speech?

*Dan Meagher* 269

In the Moonlight? The Control and Accountability of  
Government Corporations in Australia

*Yee-Fui Ng* 303

Misfeasance in Public Office: A Tort in Tension

*Ellen Rock* 337

Under Wraps: Secrecy, Confidentiality and the Enforcement of Equality Law in Australia and the United Kingdom	<i>Dominique Allen and Alysia Blackham</i>	384
Offenders Risking Deportation Deserve a Sentencing Discount — but the Reduction Should Be Provisional	<i>Mirko Bagaric, Theo Alexander and Brienna Bagaric</i>	423
Charities, Election Campaigning and the <i>Australian Constitution</i>	<i>Jennifer Leigh Beard</i>	462
Statute and Theories of Vicarious Liability	<i>Joachim Dietrich and Iain Field</i>	515
The Challenge of Medicinal Cannabis to the Political Legitimacy of Therapeutic Goods Regulation in Australia	<i>Penny Gleeson</i>	558
What Determines the Institutional Legitimacy of the High Court of Australia?	<i>Shiri Krebs, Ingrid Nielsen and Russell Smyth</i>	605
A Purposive Approach to Interpreting Australia's Complementary Protection Regime	<i>Alice Lloyd</i>	654
An Empirical Study of Exemplary Damages in Australia	<i>Felicity Maher</i>	694
Sick City Streams: New Approaches to Legal Treatments	<i>Rebecca Nelson</i>	748
CATs, Courts and the <i>Constitution</i> : The Place of Super-Tribunals in the National Judicial System	<i>Rebecca Ananian-Welsh</i>	852

Unjust Enrichment in Australia: What Is(n't) It?  
Implications for Legal Reasoning and Practice

*Kit Barker* 903

Transmission of HIV and the Criminal Law:  
Examining the Impact of Pre-Exposure Prophylaxis and  
Treatment-as Prevention

*David J Carter* 937

Addressing the Vilification of Women:  
A Functional Theory of Harm and Implications for Law

*Anjalee de Silva* 987

Principles, Pragmatism and Power:  
Another Look at the Historical Context of Section 116

*Alex Deagon and Benjamin B Saunders* 1033

Australian Historians and Historiography in the Courtroom:  
How Matters Stand Now

*Tanya Josev* 1069

## **CASE NOTE**

*Carter Holt Harvey Woodproducts Australia Pty Ltd v  
Commonwealth*  
The True Nature of the Trustee's Right of Indemnity

*Marcus Roberts* 1100

## **CRITIQUE AND COMMENT**

Common Sense and Clean Hands:  
An Ombudsman's View of Justice

*Deborah Glass OBE* 369

Female Judges, Interrupted:  
A Study of Interruption Behaviour during Oral Argument in  
the High Court of Australia

*Amelia Loughland* 822

The Intersection of Companies and Trusts

*The Hon Chief Justice James Allsop AO* 1128

## ARTICLES BY AUTHOR

- Allen, Dominique and Alysia Blackham  
*Under Wraps: Secrecy, Confidentiality and the Enforcement of  
Equality Law in Australia and the United Kingdom* 384
- Ananian-Welsh, Rebecca  
*CATs, Courts and the Constitution:  
The Place of Super-Tribunals in the National Judicial System* 852
- Anderson, Helen  
*Determining Secondary Liability:  
In Search of Legislative Coherence* 1
- Azzi, John  
*Preserving the Constitutional Function of Courts and Increasing  
Confidence in the Tax System: Time to Reconsider Futuris* 44
- Bagaric, Mirko, Theo Alexander and Brienna Bagaric  
*Offenders Risking Deportation Deserve a Sentencing Discount — but the  
Reduction Should Be Provisional* 423
- Barker, Kit  
*Unjust Enrichment in Australia: What Is(n't) It?  
Implications for Legal Reasoning and Practice* 903
- Beard, Jennifer Leigh  
*Charities, Election Campaigning and the Australian Constitution* 462
- Bottomley, Stephen  
*Rethinking the Law on Shareholder-Initiated Resolutions at  
Company General Meetings* 93
- Carter, David  
*Transmission of HIV and the Criminal Law: Examining the Impact of  
Pre-Exposure Prophylaxis and Treatment-as Prevention* 937

Chamorro-Courtland, Christian		
	<i>The Shortfall Conundrum: A New Framework for Allocating Losses in a Mixed Fund in Australia</i>	133
de Silva, Anjalee		
	<i>Addressing the Vilification of Women: A Functional Theory of Harm and Implications for Law</i>	987
Deagon, Alex and Benjamin B Saunders		
	<i>Principles, Pragmatism and Power: Another Look at the Historical Context of Section 116</i>	1033
Dietrich, Joachim and Iain Field		
	<i>Statute and Theories of Vicarious Liability</i>	515
Gleeson, Penny		
	<i>The Challenge of Medicinal Cannabis to the Political Legitimacy of Therapeutic Goods Regulation in Australia</i>	558
Hobbs, Harry and George Williams		
	<i>Treaty-Making in the Australian Federation</i>	178
Josev, Tanya		
	<i>Australian Historians and Historiography in the Courtroom: How Matters Stand Now</i>	1069
Krebs, Shiri, Ingrid Nielsen and Russell Smyth		
	<i>What Determines the Institutional Legitimacy of the High Court of Australia?</i>	605
Lavery, Daniel		
	<i>No Decorous Veil: The Continuing Reliance on an Enlarged Terra Nullius Notion in Mabo [No 2]</i>	233
Lloyd, Alice		
	<i>A Purposive Approach to Interpreting Australia's Complementary Protection Regime</i>	654

Maher, Felicity	<i>An Empirical Study of Exemplary Damages in Australia</i>	694
Meagher, Dan	<i>Is There a Common Law 'Right' to Freedom of Speech?</i>	269
Nelson, Rebecca	<i>Sick City Streams: New Approaches to Legal Treatments</i>	748
Ng, Yee-Fui	<i>In the Moonlight? The Control and Accountability of Government Corporations in Australia</i>	303

Rock, Ellen	<i>Misfeasance in Public Office: A Tort in Tension</i>	337
-------------	--	-----

#### **CASE NOTE BY AUTHOR**

Roberts, Marcus	<i>Carter Holt Harvey Woodproducts Australia Pty Ltd v Commonwealth The True Nature of the Trustee's Right of Indemnity</i>	1100
-----------------	---	------

#### **CRITIQUE AND COMMENT BY AUTHOR**

Allsop AO, The Hon Chief Justice James	<i>The Intersection of Companies and Trusts</i>	1128
Glass OBE, Deborah	<i>Common Sense and Clean Hands: An Ombudsman's View of Justice</i>	369
Loughland, Amelia	<i>Female Judges, Interrupted: A Study of Interruption Behaviour during Oral Argument in the High Court of Australia</i>	822